

PLANNING AND TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

Tuesday, 14 July 2015

Minutes of the meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee held at Guildhall on Tuesday, 14 July 2015 at 10.30 am

Present

Members:

Michael Welbank (Chairman)	Gregory Jones QC
Marianne Fredericks (Deputy Chairman)	Alderman Professor Michael Mainelli
Oliver Lodge	Paul Martinelli
Randall Anderson	Brian Mooney
Alex Bain-Stewart	Deputy Alastair Moss
David Bradshaw	Sylvia Moys
Dennis Cotgrove	Graham Packham
Revd Dr Martin Dudley	Judith Pleasance
Peter Dunphy	Deputy Henry Pollard
Alderman Peter Estlin	Alderman William Russell
Sophie Fernandes	Tom Sleigh
Deputy Bill Fraser	Graeme Smith
George Gillon	Angela Starling
Alderman Timothy Hailes	Patrick Streeter
Deputy Brian Harris	Deputy James Thomson
Christopher Hayward	

Officers:

Lorraine Brook	Town Clerk's Department
Julie Mayer	Town Clerk's Department
Deborah Cluett	Comptrollers and City Solicitor's Department
Philip Everett	Director of the Built Environment
Annie Hampson	Department of the Built Environment
Paul Beckett	Department of the Built Environment
Gwyn Richards	Department of the Built Environment
Ian Hughes	Department of the Built Environment
Paul Monaghan	Department of the Built Environment
Iain Simmons	Department of the Built Environment
Martin Rodman	Open Spaces Department
Alan Rickwood	City of London Police
Alexander Williams	City of London Police
Bella Longman	Public Relations Office

1. APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from Alderman Peter Estlin; Deputy Henry Jones and Deputy Kevin Everett.

Retirement of the Director of the Built Environment

The Chairman opened the meeting by paying tribute to retiring Director, Mr Philip Everett. Mr Everett had worked at the City of London Corporation since 2001 and been a Director since 2006. The Chairman commended Mr Everett for his extensive experience and professional delivery on all manner of issues; from pot-holes to high level debates on vast and complex developments. Furthermore, Mr Everett had always remained calm, courteous and direct.

The Chairman then welcomed the new Director, Carolyn Dwyer, who would take up her position 19th August 2015.

2. MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

- Ms Sophie Fernandes expressed a non-pecuniary (personal) interest in respect of agenda item 6 (a) 5-7 Ireland Yard, as she has a personal friendship with a developmental lead in this project. Ms Fernandes therefore left the meeting when this item was discussed and voted on.
- Mr Randall Anderson expressed a pecuniary interest in respect of item 6 (b) Barbican Trade Centre, Golden Lane, as he is a tenant of the Barbican Estate. Mr Anderson therefore left the meeting when this item was discussed and voted on.

3. MINUTES

RESOLVED – That the Minutes of the meeting held on 23rd June 2015 be approved.

4. TOWN PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT APPLICATIONS

The Committee received a report of the City Planning Officer and Development Director in respect of the development and advertisement applications dealt with under delegated authority since the last meeting.

- In response to a query in respect of the externally illuminated commercial advertisement at St Paul's Churchyard, Members noted that this had been refused.
- In response to a query in respect of the refurbishment of the Pathology Building at St Bartholomews' Hospital, Members noted that the substantive application had been approved by the Committee. The application set out in the report was for alterations to a previously approved scheme and the full report was available to Members on request.

RESOLVED – That the report be noted.

5. VALID APPLICATIONS LIST FOR COMMITTEE

The Committee received a report of the Chief Planning Office and Development Director which provided details of valid planning applications received by the department since the last meeting.

RESOLVED – that the report be noted.

6. REPORTS RELATIVE TO PLANNING APPLICATIONS

6.1 5 - 7 Ireland Yard, London EC4V 5EH

Proposal: Alterations to the façade including: 1) replacement of external cladding at ground floor level; 2) replacement of existing windows with double glazed steel framed windows throughout the building; 3) new double glazed steel framed entrance door to Friar Street; 4) replacement double glazed steel framed entrance doors to Ireland Yard.

The City Planning Officer advised the Committee that one of the objectors had provided a measurement of the width of Friar Street (of 2.87m) which she accepted.

Ms Ann Holmes and Mr Simon Barnes spoke in objection to the scheme; their concerns related to noise, residential amenity, traffic and highways (i.e. the extremely narrow width of Friar Street) and the location of an additional door onto the street.

The Agent, Mr Matt Thorley was present to answer questions and the following matters were raised during the ensuing debate:

- The additional entrance would increase the flexibility of use of the proposed office space; it was expected that 22 workers could use the door. At present, the agent could not specify the number of workers that would be housed in the building.
- Low level noise confined to office hours was generally considered to be acceptable.
- Employers generally do not allow their workers to congregate and smoke near doorways.
- The correct notification had been displayed and residents duly notified.
- Members accepted and empathised with the concerns of residents but understood the need to strike a balance with the business community in the City and the need for high quality office accommodation.

On being put to the vote, 14 voted in favour, 5 against, with 3 abstentions and the application was approved.

RESOLVED – That the above application, for the above proposal, be granted in accordance with the details set out in the attached schedule.

6.2 **15/00203/FULL Barbican Trade Centre Golden Lane London EC2Y
8DS**

Proposal: alterations to the ground and first floor elevations and podium level floor of Exhibition Hall 1, in association with the occupation of the premises by the London Film School.

The City Planning Officer advised of an amendment to the printed report whereby permission for use of this part of the Barbican Trade Centre, as an exhibition hall, was granted in February 1980 and not October 1980.

Members were reminded that there had been a number of objectors, primarily in respect of change of use (D1), which was not a material change of use. The Conditions would be amended to include odour control and wording to deal with matters in the email from Markets and Consumer Protection Department set out on pages 131/132 of the report.

Mr John Whitehead and Mr Bruce Badger spoke in objection to the application and set out residents' concerns in respect of noise, changes to the listed fabric of the Barbican (i.e. the new plant room), light from the frontage, smells from smokers and the café.

The Director of the London Film School, Jane Roscoe, spoke in support of the application, setting out the drivers behind the decision to relocate. The Architect, Mr James Taylor, advised Members that all consultation feedback had been carefully considered and he had twice met the Barbican Association to discuss aspects of the lease. There would be no odour from ventilation plants; just air circulation. In response to a question, the Architect advised that there had been no application for a late licence at the coffee bar.

The Chairman asked the Town Clerk to write to the City Surveyor, setting out the above concerns and particularly that the regular maintenance pursuant to the planning condition should include noise testing to ensure that there was no deterioration in the noise performance of plant and equipment installed.

Whilst understanding the concerns of residents, Members generally felt that the development was attractive and would enhance the amenity of the local area.

Upon being put the vote, the application was approved unanimously.

RESOLVED - That the above application for the above proposal be granted in accordance with the details set out in the above schedule.

6.3 **15/00204/LBC Barbican Trade Centre Golden Lane London EC2Y
8DS**

Proposal: alterations to the ground and first floor elevations and podium level floor of Exhibition Hall 1 in association with the occupation of the premises by the London Film School.

RESOLVED – That listed building consent be granted for the above proposal, in accordance with the details set out in the attached schedule.

7. REPORTS OF THE DIRECTOR OF THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT

7.1 Department of the Built Environment Business Plan 2014/17: End of Year Update and Financial Outturn Report

The Committee considered a report of the Director of the Built Environment, which set out progress against the 2014/17 Business Plan and the Financial Outturn Report for the Department of the Built Environment.

Members suggested that the approach to road danger reduction might need more joined up thinking and asked for a further report, with particular focus on the 20mph speed limit. Members commended the Awards received by the Transportation Team.

7.2 Future City - Outlook to 2025

The Committee received a report and presentation of the Director of the Built Environment, which provided an overview of how the City was evolving; now and over the next 10 years. Members noted that an Officer/Member Working Party would be set up, after recess, in order to consider the drivers for change. The Chairman of the Health and Wellbeing Board was in attendance and emphasised the Board's commitment to this project and the significance of healthy office environments in workers' happiness and wellbeing.

RESOLVED – that the report be noted.

7.3 Foster Lane and Finsbury Circus draft Conservation Area Character Summaries and Management Strategy SPDs

The Committee received a report of the Chief Planning Officer in respect of draft Supplementary Planning Documents (SPDs) for Foster Lane Conservation Area and Finsbury Circus Character Summaries and Management Strategies. The documents were issued for public consultation in March/April 2015 and in response to comments received, a number of amendments were set out in the report.

RESOLVED – That:

1. The amendments to the Foster Lane and Finsbury Circus Conservation Area SPDs, as set out in Appendix B to the report, be agreed.
2. Members resolve to adopt the amended Foster Lane and Finsbury Circus Conservation Area SPD's.

7.4 **Revenue Outturn 2014/15**

The Committee received a joint report of the Chamberlain, the Director of the Built Environment, the City Surveyor and the Director of Culture, Heritage and Libraries, which compared the revenue outturn for the services overseen by the Planning and Transportation Committee in 2014/15 with the final budget for the year.

RESOLVED – That the Revenue Outturn Report for 2014/15 and the proposed carry forward of underspends to 2015/16 be noted.

8. **CITY OF LONDON AIR QUALITY STRATEGY 2015 - 2020 (AND UPDATE)**

The Committee received a report of the Director of Markets and Consumer Protection in respect of the Air Quality Strategy for 2015 – 20.

During the discussion on this item, the following matters were raised/noted:

- There should be more enforcement action on idling vehicles.
- Members strongly objected to the use of shredder vans.
- There was no reference to the number and size of refrigerated vehicles moving in and out of Smithfield.

Consideration be given to granting planning permission only when resultant pollutants from premises are neutral.

- It was understood that 80% of Air Pollution comes into the City but only 20% of Air Pollution is generated within the City, primarily by traffic.
- Planning Officers and the Chairman would meet with the Chairman of Port Health to share the Committee's views.
- The report could have gone to the Planning and Transportation Committee and the Health and Wellbeing Board for comments, before being presented to the Port Health and Environmental Services Committee for decision.
- Given that the City of London initiated the national legislation to control smog when the City Act in 1954 presaged the national Act in 1956, it should have a lead, strategic role with the current clean air campaign for London.

It was Proposed by Mr Streeter and Seconded by Mr Mooney that the Air Quality Strategy 2015-20 be considered inadequate in its current form, as it lacked pace and required a more radical approach.

RESOLVED – That:

1. The Port Health and Environmental Services Committee note the comments of the Planning and Transportation Committee as set out above and at Resolution 2 below.
2. The Strategy be considered inadequate in its current form as it lacked pace and required a more radical approach.

At 12.30, the Committee agreed to waive standing orders in order to complete the business on the agenda.

9. **QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**

1. **The Mayor's Vision for Cycling – 'Quietways'**

Further to an article in Monday's Evening Standard on the Mayor's Vision for Cycling, officers provided Members with a summary of the report presented to Streets and Walkways Sub Committee, the previous day, in respect of a Gateway 3/4 Options Appraisal Report : 'The Mayor's Vision for Cycling – Quietways'. Members noted that a press release was being prepared in response.

2. **Sugar Quay**

A Hearing date had been set for 20th July and documents exchanged.

10. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT**

The Chairman agreed to the admission of an item of urgent business, as follows:

City Fund Highway Declaration – Thames Tideway Tunnel Development at Blackfriars – Report of the Comptroller and City Solicitor.

The Committee considered a report of the Comptroller and City Solicitor in respect of the Thames Tideway Tunnel Development at Blackfriars. In response to a question about possible disruptions to pedestrians, the officers confirmed that there would be some occupation on the footpath. In response to a Member's question as to why a requirement for subsoil resulted in surface level highway being removed the Chairman asked for a plan or drawing to clarify the position to be provided to the Member.

RESOLVED – That an area of highway/river wall at Paul's Walk, Blackfriars, EC4 measuring in total approximately 1,451 ft² (134.81 m²) be declared surplus to highway requirements, in order to enable its disposal to Thames Water Utilities Limited, for incorporation into the Thames Tideway Tunnel permanent works at Blackfriars foreshore, upon terms to be subject to the approval of the Property Investment Board; the resolution to take effect upon the land ceasing to be a highway structure and following its incorporation into the Thames Tideway Tunnel permanent works.

11. **EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC**
RESOLVED – That under Section 100A(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that they involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part I of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act.
12. **NON-PUBLIC MINUTES**
RESOLVED – That the non-public minutes of the meeting held on 23rd June 2015 be approved.
13. **NON-PUBLIC QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE**
There were no questions.
14. **DEBT ARREARS - PLANNING & TRANSPORTATION PERIOD ENDING 31ST MARCH 2015**
Members received a report of the Director of the Built Environment
15. **ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREES SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED**
There were no further items of urgent business.

The meeting ended at 12.50 pm

Chairman

Contact Officer: Katie Odling
tel. no.: 020 7332 3414
katie.odling@cityoflondon.gov.uk